**Scots on the Western Front Comparison Question**

**Source A**: by John Jackson, Private 12768: Memoir of a Tommy (2004) writing about the Battle of Loos.

*The situation at Hill 70 was serious. A third time the order was given to attack that awful hillside, but the enemy were too many for us and again we fell back, truly we were determined to hold on to the motto of the regiment: “A Cameron never can yield”. This time we meant to do or die. As the evening drew on we made a final attempt to win and hold the ridge. While shells crashed all around us and to the sound of the pipes, we were led by our brave old colonel, with no other weapon than his walking stick, we made for the top of Hill 70 through murderous rifle and machine gun fire. We made the top but now we were desperate for the promised reinforcements but no help could we see.*

**Source B**: by Philip Gibbs, official British wartime correspondent on the Western Front

for the Daily Chronicle , writing about the Battle of Loos.

*By 7:40, the two assaulting brigades of the 15th Division had left the trenches and were in the open. Shriller than the scream of shells above them was the skirl of pipes, then our orders were given. The Scots were to go “all out”, and to press on to the ridge, with the absolute assurance that all the ground they gained would be held behind them by supporting troops. With the promise of reinforcements to follow, they trudged on against the German machine gunners. Then the quietude of Hill 70 was broken by the beginning of a new bombardment from German guns. “Dig in”, said the officers. “We must hold on at all costs until the reinforcements come up.*

Compare the views of **Sources A** and **B** about the experience of Scots on the Western Front.

Compare the sources overall and in detail. **5**

**Marking Scheme**

Candidates can be credited in a number of ways up to a maximum of 5 marks.

Possible points of comparison may include:

Overall: **Source A** and **Source B** offer some similar and some contrasting opinions on the

experience of Scots on the Western Front with regard to the taking of Hill 70. Both agree that the pipes played during the attack and that no reinforcements arrived.

However **Source A** reflects the tenacity and dogged determination required by Scots during a long and difficult attack whilst **Source B** skirts over difficulties and gives the impression of an easier, successful attack.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Source A** | **Source B** |
| • “A Cameron can never yield”. This  time we meant to do or die. | • The Scots were to go “all out”, and to  press on to Hill 70. |
| • While shells crashed all around us and to the sound of the pipes, we were  led by our brave old colonel. | • Shriller than the scream of shells  above them was the skirl of pipes, then our orders were given. |
| • We made for the top of Hill 70  through murderous rifle and machine gun fire. | • They trudged on against the German  machine gunners. Then the quietude of Hill 70 was broken by the beginning of a new bombardment from German guns. |
| • We were desperate for the promised reinforcements but no help could we see. | • We must hold on at all costs until the reinforcements come up. |

.