**National 5 Evaluation Questions**

**Source A** is from the memoirs of Lieutenant George Craik, who fought with the 12th Battalion Highland Light Infantry in 1915.

**Source A**

*When we arrived at Loos the trenches were not in too bad a state. The problems for commanders were organising supplies and suitable living conditions. The other problem was the disposal of the many dead lying all about. This could only be done under cover of darkness. To venture into no man’s land in daylight was instant death.*

Evaluate the usefulness of **Source A** as evidence of conditions in trenches for soldiers during the First World War.

(You may want to comment on who wrote it, when they wrote it, why they wrote it, what they said or what has been missed out)

**Marking Scheme**

*Candidates can be credited in a number of ways* ***up to a maximum of 5 marks****.*

Candidates must make a judgement about the usefulness of the source and support this by making evaluative comments on identified aspects of the source.

**1 mark** should be given for each relevant comment made, **up to a maximum of 5 marks.**

* A maximum of **4 marks** can be given for evaluative comments relating to the author, type of source, purpose and timing.
* A maximum of **2 marks** may be given for comments relating to the content of the source.
* A maximum of **2 marks** may be given for comments relating to points of significant omission.

**Model answer**

Source A is useful as evidence of conditions in trenches for soldiers during the First World War to the extent that *it is written by Lieutenant George Craik.* ***This makes it useful as he was an eyewitness to trench life during the war.***

It is written in 1915 making it a primary source. **This makes it useful as it is the time that trench warfare was developing due to the stalemate in the open war.**

It is written as part of George Craik’s memoirs **which makes it useful as he was an eye witness but as they were written years later when his memory might have been fading this could make it slightly less useful.**

The source shows the type of problems that officers might have to deal with which **makes it useful as it is fairly typical for most officers** and that the trenches were not in too bad a state **which is not exaggerated making it a useful statement.** However, it was a bit of an exaggeration to say that leaving the trenches in daylight meant “instant death” **which makes it slightly less useful**.

Finally the source fails to mention that once the trenches were more established diseases such as Trench foot thrived as the drainage systems were destroyed by shellfire and the trenches became muddy and that many soldiers trapped in such conditions began to suffer from shellshock **which makes the source less useful.**

**Examples of aspects of the source and relevant comments.**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Aspects of the Source** | **Possible comment** |
| **Author:**  Lieutenant George Craik | Eyewitness to the events but was an officer so has a particular perspective. |
| **Type of Source:**  Memoirs | Personal recollections, but well after the events. |
| **Purpose:**  To explain the extent of the problems faced by officers at Loos. | Purpose may have caused the writer to exaggerate the problem, so source may be less useful. |
| **Timing:**  1915 | At a point where the war had reached stalemate. |
| **Content:**  The trenches were not in too bad a state. | Useful as it is not exaggerated. |
| One problem for commanders was the organising of supplies and suitable living conditions. | Useful as it describes a typical situation for officers. |
| To venture out into no man’s land in daylight was instant death. | Less useful as it shows a degree of exaggeration. |

**Possible points of significant omission may include:**

* Wet and muddy
* Trench foot and other diseases
* Use of tinned food
* Chlorine tablets to purify the water
* Snipers
* Shell shock.

**Source B** is a Government photograph of British troops taking part in an attack on the Western Front in 1916.

**Source B**

Evaluate the usefulness of **Source B** as evidence of the fighting on the Western Front. **5**

**(**You may wish to comment on who produced it, when they took it, why they took it, what it tells us or what has been missed out)

**Source C** is about what Scotland was like before 1914. It is by Tom Devine and Richard Finlay, both modern historians.

*At the beginning of the twentieth century, Scotland by any measure was one of the great manufacturing centres of the world. The Clyde built nearly a fifth of the world’s total output of ships. In the Western Lowlands, the coal engineering and shipbuilding and metal manufacturers sent products to all parts of the globe. The great fact of Scottish industry in the twentieth century was how that industry declined.*

Evaluate the usefulness of **Source C** as evidence of what Scotland was like before 1914?

(You may wish to comment on who wrote it, when they wrote it, why they wrote it, what they say and what has been missed out.) **6**