**Comparisons National 5**

**How to answer Comparison Questions.**

This type of question asks you to compare the views of 2 sources on a particular topic.

* The sources will either: totally agree, agree to a certain extent or completely disagree.

It is up to you to make a judgement as to what points they **agree on** and what points they disagree on.

You must interpret evidence and make direct comparisons between sources.

You should start with an overall comparison and go on to the detailed comparison on a point by point basis.

4 marks can be awarded for this type of question.

1 mark can be given for each simple point of comparison.

A 2nd mark can be awarded for each developed point of comparison.

You can gain full marks by making four simple comparisons, two developed comparisons or any combination of these.

You will be given the following prompt with the question. (Compare the sources overall and/or in detail).

Compare the overall views of the sources.

Compare the sources point by point

i.e. Source A says …… and Source B agrees by saying …….

Compare points of agreement

Compare points of disagreement

A comparison can be developed by stating the agreement or disagreement in your own words.

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

**Your task is to mark each of the following answers awarding marks on the basis of the above general marking scheme. You will also be expected to explain why you gave, or did not give marks.**

**Once you have marked the 2 answers for Question 1, answer Question 2 yourself.**

**Source A** is about the attack of the Black watch regiment at Loos, 1915

*The Black Watch marched with determination. They got into the German line, but were unsupported. Two companies disappeared and the remainder were sorely shattered. The whole affair was absolute carnage. The second attack was just murder, sending brave men to certain death, and, my God, they met it like men too.*

**Source B** is about the attack of the Black watch regiment at Loos, 1915, as reported by a German newspaper.

*Then the British came through with tremendous fierceness. They sent in one of their best Highland regiments to the front, the best they have anywhere. The Black watch advanced. The gallant Scots came on and even managed to get into our trench, but even their really heroic bravery was in vain, for they were not able to turn the fate of the day.*

Compare the views of **Sources A** and **B** on the attack of the Black watch at Loos. **4**

**Answer A**

*Overall the sources agree about the attack of the Black Watch at Loos in 1915. They agree that the regiment reached the German trenches as source A states “They got into the front line” and source B agrees by saying ”they even managed to get into out trench”.*

*They also agree about the courage of the troops as source A says “They marched with determination” and source B agrees by saying ” they came through with tremendous fierceness”.*

*Both sources also agree that the battle was not successful as source A says ”the whole affair was carnage” and Source B agrees by saying ”their heroic bravery was in vain”.*

*Finally both sources suggest that the casualties were high. Source A states that “two companies disappeared and the remainder were sorely shattered”. While source B suggests that the attack was a heroic failure”.*

**Reasons**

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**Mark Given**

**Answer B**

*The sources agree about the Black Watch attack on Loos because Source A says “they got into the front line and Source B agrees by saying “they got into our trench”. They also agree that as source A says “They marched with determination” and source B agrees by saying ” they came through with tremendous fierceness”. Only source a mentions that they were one of the best regiments.*

**Reasons**

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**Mark Given**

**Source A** was written by a Senator from Alabama in 1921. He is explaining why he wanted immigration controls.

*As soon as the immigrants step off the decks of our ships our* problem has begun – *Bolshevism, red anarchy, crooks and kidnappers. Thousands come here who never take the oath to support our Constitution and become citizens of the United States. They do not respect what our flag represents. They pay allegiance to some other country and flag while they live upon the benefits of our own. They are of no service whatever to our people. They constitute a menace and a danger to us every day.*

**Source B** is a description by Robert Coughlan of the growth of support for the Ku Klux Klan in the 1920s.

*It may be asked why, then, did the town take so enthusiastically to the Klan? Many old stock Americans believed they were in danger of being overrun. The “foreigners were running our country”; and so anything “foreign” was “un-American” and a menace. Cars were draped with the American flag and some carried homemade signs with Klan slogans such as “America for the Americans”.*

Compare the views of **Sources A** and **B** about American attitudes to immigrants in the 1920s. (Compare the views overall and/or in detail.) **4**