**2015 Evaluation Question**

**The “evaluate the usefulness” question is worth 6 marks.**

There are several ways you can build up your marks for this question.

Remember to answer the question that is asked. You are not being asked to judge how useful a source is, you are being asked how useful it is for finding out about a specific historical event.

Below the question in the exam paper you will find this instruction:

* The origin and purpose of the source.
* The content of the source.
* Your own knowledge.

In reality you can get up to 4 marks for writing about the **ORIGIN AND PURPOSE,** WHO produced it, what TYPE of source it is, WHY the source was produced and WHEN it was produced – all help to make the source useful in terms of the question.

You can get 2marks for explaining why the CONTENT of the source is useful for judging the source’s usefulness.

You can also get 2marks for commenting on what is not in the source (from your OWN KNOWLEDGE) that would, if it had been included, have made the source more useful.

**WHO**

Here is a style of answering a “how useful” that will gain you full marks once you have added relevant information.

The **origin** of the source is ….. and this makes it useful because …… *(Comment on who or what the author is and why information from that person would make the source useful in terms of the question.)*

The source for the “How useful” question will always be from a primary source so you can be sure that the author of the source was involved in the events that the question is asking about in some way.

The **purpose** of the source was probably to ……… *(Inform? Persuade? Relieve boredom? Persuade someone to do something?)* and this makes it useful because ….. *(In* *other words suggest a* ***likely*** *reason WHY the author of the source wrote it. Remember even biased thoughts or propaganda are still useful because it shows how people felt at the time.)*

**DATE**

The **date** of the source also makes the source useful because ……. *(Was it during an important event and therefore shows how people felt at the time, or was it later suggesting the author has had time to look back on the event and perhaps take a more balanced viewpoint?)*

**TYPE**

 The **type** of source is an extract from a ….. *(What type of source is it? A diary? An official report? A letter)* and this makes it useful because …….

**CONTENT**

The **content** of the source is also useful because it contains information relevant to the topic. The source states “………” *(In other words how does the content of the source help us to understand the events or the opinion of people involved in the event?)*

**Do the content section twice for 2 marks.**

**WHAT IS MISSING**

The source however is limited because it does not mention “……” *(Include something from recall that would have made the source a more complete version of events?)*

**Do the “missing” section twice for 2 marks.**

**Source D**: from an editorial comment made in a newspaper, 1st February 1919.

*It is impossible not to be upset by the disgraceful proceedings of yesterday in George Square and other parts of the city. In the scenes of violence and bloodshed there have been no fatalities to report but 53 people were injured by the throwing of missiles or the use of the baton. David Kirkwood, one of the strike leaders, and a member of the ILP, is under arrest on the charge of inciting the mob. It has been known from the first that the strike movement is controlled by a small section of the Clyde Workers’ Committee who are pressing for a 40 hour week. Many works on Clydeside have been closed due to picketing by crowds numbering several hundreds of strikers that can only be called organised intimidation. The revolutionary activities of these Bolshevists have damaged Glasgow’s reputation.*

Evaluate the usefulness of **Source D** as evidence of political developments in Scotland after the war.

In making a judgement you should refer to:

• the origin and possible purpose of the source

• the content of the source

• your own knowledge

*Source D is fairly useful as evidence of political developments in Scotland after the war. The source is an editorial comment from the Glasgow Herald newspaper, which is useful as a respected Scottish newspaper and would contain accurate relevant information about Scottish political developments. However the author of the source is a journalist who works for the Herald so this is less useful because they could be biased about politics in Scotland depending on their personal view about politics. The purpose of the source is to inform people about the events of Red Clydeside which was a key political movement in Scotland which is useful because it should provide an accurate and reliable account of Red Clydeside’s political developments. The timing of the source is 1st February 1919 which is useful because the battle of George Square took place on 31st January 1919 making it published the day after the events and so it could be an eye witness account, so the information should be accurate, detailed and reliable. The source states that “David Kirkwood, one of the strike leaders, and a member of the ILP, is under arrest on the charge of inciting the mob.” This is useful because David Kirkwood led the Clyde Workers Committee alongside John MacLean and Willie Gallagher, and Kirkwood being an ILP member knew that the ILP were gaining momentum in Scottish politics as a result of Red Clydeside as they appealed to those wanting changes to be made after the war. The source also claims that “the Clyde Workers Committee who are pressing for a 40 hour week. This is useful because it shows that after the war, the CWC wanted a shorter working week to accommodate for all the returning soldiers, so that those who had filled their jobs should not be out of work, and this was a major political development in Scotland. The source has limitations as it fails to mention that the Labour Party rose in popularity after the war and in 1918 they had 1/3 of all Scottish votes, then in the 1922 election they won 29 Scottish seats (10 in Glasgow) which is useful as it shows the major political developments after the war. Conservatives also gained after the war because they appealed to the middle class and also those in Scotland who did not want uprisings which is useful as it shows how the Conservative Party gained support and increased in popularity after the war. The ILP also rose further in popularity, peaking with a 1/3 of total membership being Scots and having 300 of its 1000 UK branches which shows just how far they developed in politics after the war.*

Comments on marking of question 15.

The candidate was awarded 6 marks because relevant evaluative comments are made on authorship, type of source, purpose and timing. The candidate clearly explains why each aspect of the source makes it useful in terms of the question.

Two evaluative comments are made on the content of the source with clear explanations of why the points identified are relevant to the question. There are three evaluative comments relating to significant omission/recall.